Exploring Differences in Persian Dubbed and Subtitled Versions of the Songs in Animated Musical Movies

Setareh Hajebi[1]*, Aynaz Samir[2]

Abstract

Translation Studies (TS) moved away from the focus on literary translation and linguistic approaches to new types of translation called Audiovisual translation (AVT). Technological advancements affected the development of AVT. Technology created a situation in the world of moving pictures within which subtitling and dubbing take an important role in optimizing communication. Despite the growing interest in AVT, song subtitling and dubbing remain on the periphery of TS. Therefore, this study aimed to identify the differences that may exist between the strategies used for subtitling and dubbing the songs on some special musical animations from English into Persian based on Schioldager et al.'s (2008) twelve micro-strategies. The corpus of this study consisted of three musical animations which are *Strange Magic*, *Moana*, and *Frozen 2*. This study focused on nine songs in each animation. The songs had meaningful lyrics, established the character(s), aided in the narrative, and made the audience relate to the character or the story. Hence, in the selected animations 27 songs were selected. The data were analyzed using a chi-squared test. The results indicated a statistically significant difference between six out of 12 strategies for dubbing and subtitling the animation's songs. The differences were related to "Direct Translation", "Oblique translation", "Adaption", "Addition", "Substitution", and "Deletion". The results revealed the most frequent micro strategies used by Iranian translators in dubbing songs were "Oblique Translation", "Deletion", "Substitution", and "Adaptation". However, "Direct Translation" and "Addition" were the most used strategies in subtitling songs in animations. Thus, it was revealed that the translator in dubbing not only transferred the dialogue from the source text but also considered the source text idea. The findings offered a pedagogical implication for translation students, subtitlers, and dubbers to recognize better the subtitling and dubbing strategies that were being used by translators in the Iranian context.

Keywords: Dubbing; Iranian Translators; Song; Subtitling; Translation Strategies

---

[1] MA Student in English Translation, English Department, Tabaran Institute of Higher Education, Mashhad, Iran, E-mail: setareh.hajebi@gmail.com
[2] English Department, Tabaran Institute of Higher Education, Mashhad, Iran, E-mail: a.samir@tabaran.ac.ir

1. Introduction

Translation Studies moved away from the focus on literary translation and linguistic approaches to new types of translation called audiovisual translation (AVT). Audiovisual materials, like movies, animation, and music are so popular among people. There is not any problem when each country makes the movie or animation in the language, that their people speak (Aminoroaya & Amirian, 2016). Problems will occur when one of the audiovisual materials passes the geographical border and enters a new country or a new culture. In this regard, in the world of moving pictures subtitling and dubbing as two types of AVT take an important role in optimizing communication.

Investigating subtitling and dubbing strategies in the field of Translation Studies (TS) is a new subject of study these days and some translation scholars pay significant attention to it. However, despite the growing interest in AVT, song subtitling and dubbing remain on the periphery of Translation Studies. Song translation has a challenging process because the translator's task is not only translating the meaning of the original lyric but also their task is paying attention to the other factors such as the rhythm of the music when they are creating the translated version of a song (Stephenson, 2014). In this regard, when translators adapt a musical to a new language, they may translate the spoken dialogue and keep the song lyric in the original language, or translate the song lyric (Åkerström, 2010). Another challenging part of the translation process is that "the target listeners are children" because the children have limited experience and knowledge about vocabulary and idioms (Rurangwa, 2006). Children's language is different from the adult language. Children may have some problems in comprehending words that are unfamiliar to them or words that are not so common in their daily conversation (Akerstorm, 2009). Thus, the translators must be careful of the level of the child's understanding when they are translating the song lyrics as the target listener because children have a special capacity in understanding the lyrics (Stolze, 2003).

In addition, the dialogue, or the songs of animations on subtitle and dub, sometimes are the same and in some cases, they are completely different. Most of the time in the subtitled version, the translation is the word for word, while in the dubbed version the translation is the sense for sense, etc (Aminoroaya & Amirian,2016). Thus, subtitle and dubbed versions of the same song are completely different. Besides, the subtitled version and dubbed versions are different from each other because in the dubs version the dialogue is reviewed by several people like the translator, the supervisor, the director, etc (Aminoroaya & Amirian,2016).

As mentioned before, the role of animations songs is important because they can change the plot of the animation, they express the feeling of the characters or they can change the addresses' opinions. The differences between the subtitled version and dubbed version are the case of misunderstanding between the addresses. It means that the main problem is that the addresses as children or teenagers are confused and do not understand the meaning of which translation version (e.g., the subtitle version or dubbed version of the same song) is appropriate (Aminoroaya & Amirian, 2016). To overcome this problem, translators should employ different strategies for dubbing and subtitling the songs of animation movies to convey the messages of the original songs' lyrics. Consequently, the purpose of the study is to investigate the differences that may exist between Iranian translators' strategies for subtitling and dubbing the songs in animation movies called Moana, Frozen2, and Strange Magic according to Schjoldager

et al.'s (2008) twelve micro-strategies. The question that ought to be answered in this investigation was as follows:

RQ1. Is there any significant difference between the strategies used by Iranian translators for dubbing and subtitling the songs of selected animation movies based on Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) model?

Based on the above-mentioned question, the following null hypothesis was developed:

HO1. There is no significant difference between the strategies used by Iranian translators for dubbing and subtitling the songs of selected animation movies.

2. Review of Literature

Currently, people's daily life is related to audiovisual products like news, animation, movie, music, etc. Audiovisuals are created of several codes that act together to create one movie effectively. Audiovisual products have verbal messages which being understood acoustically and visually. On a different level, audiovisual products contain both visual, verbal, and nonverbal information such as; background noises, music, songs, body sounds, actors' gestures and movements, scenery, colors, special effects, billboards, street signs, notes, songs, and letters which all transfer meaning (Chiaro, 2013). These verbal and visual messages should transfer in the target language (TL) within the translation process. Therefore, AVT requires taking into account both verbal and visual information (Chiaro, 2012). According to Aminoroaya and Amirian, (2016) AVT is the fastest expanding area within the realm of TS. AVT is one of the main research fields of TS (Aminoroaya & Amirian, 2016). "AVT is one of several overlapping umbrella terms that include 'media translation', 'multimedia translation', 'multimodal translation', and 'screen translation'" (Chiaro, 2009, p. 141). As Chiaro (2013) truly states "AVT is the term used to refer to the transfer from one language to another of the verbal and nonverbal components contained in audiovisual works and products" (p. 1).

Furthermore, nowadays animations and cartoons, are also part of audiovisual products which attract children's attention. Most of the audience of audiovisual products including animations are children and teenagers who are not English native speakers (Chauhan, 2020). It is worth mentioning that, a case of animations and cartoons is animation's song. "In film products, as well as what the actors say, audiences may also hear the lyrics of songs while simultaneously being exposed to a range of written information such as street signs, billboards, letters, notes, and so forth" (Chiaro, 2013, p. 1). Thus, the songs express the feeling of the characters that may not be in the movie directly. Sometimes songs can change the plot of the animation or they can change the addresses' opinions into positive or negative. Songs can add some varieties to the animation. In this regard, most of the time songs have lots of information about animation or characters (Aminoroaya & Amirian, 2016). Music and songs are essential features of people's lives, but song lyric has never been an explored field within translation studies (Susam-Sarajeva, 2008, p. 187). Thus, one of the forms of translation is song translation that which helps the listeners that have different languages not only enjoy the rhythm of music but supports them to enjoy the meaning of foreign song lyrics and understand the meaning (Leni & Pattiwael, 2019). Song Translation is a piece of music and lyrics - in which one has been adapted to the other, or both to one another – designed for a singing performance

(Franzon, 2008). Song Translation is the second form of source song which gives the song's essential values of music, lyrics, and the song's performance to reproduce in a TL (Franzon, 2008).

It is worth mentioning that, in the different group of audiovisual translation methods, dubbing and subtitling is the most common (Sadeghpour, 2013). Dubbing is a process that 'lip-sync', where the source language voice-track is replaced by a target language voice-track (Munday, 2016). "Dubbing means the replacement of a soundtrack for a new one, with a different language than the original" (Borell, 2000, p.4). "Due to its high costs and complex process in which many professionals are involved – translators, adaptors/dialogue writers, dubbing directors and actors, sound technicians –dubbing is virtually restricted to the translation of films, TV series and sitcoms, children's programs, and the sporadic commercial" (Cintas, & Orero, 2010, p. 442). Dubbing is the replacement of the original speech by voice track which is a faithful translation of the original speech and which attempts to reproduce the timing, phrasing, and lip movements of the original (Luyken, Thomas, Langham-Brown, Reid, & Spinhof, 1991). Besides, subtitling is a form of literary translation that deviates considerably from other translation types (Roks, 2014). According to Shuttleworth and Cowie (2004), Subtitling is "used to refer to one of the two main methods of language transfer used in translating types of mass audio-visual communication such as film and television" (p. 61). "Subtitling is used for some audiovisual products, such as cinema, television, video, DVD, LaserDisc, CDRom, computer games, Internet and live performances, etc" (Liu, 2014, p. 1103). "Subtitling means that a text is shown together with visual material, such as a film. It usually consists of a written version of the lines found in the soundtrack" (Borell, 2000, p.4). The language of subtitle can be the same as on the language of source soundtrack, or it can be different. Subtitling is defined as a translation practice consist of presenting a written text in the lower parts of the screen with the purpose to tell the original dialogue of the speakers, the discursive elements that appear in the image, and the soundtrack that comes along with the image (Cintas&Remael, 2014, p.8).

In Iran, the dialogue is usually dubbed and sometimes they have subtitles but the songs of the animation were in the original language. However, recently some companies like Tiny Movie Website, Glory Entertainment, KingMovie Website, and Diba Movie Website dub the songs. In this regard, all the children and teenagers can understand the messages of the original song lyrics (Aminoraya & Amirian,2016). In this regard, translators employ different translation strategies to convey the messages of the original song lyrics for subtitling and dubbing. Schjoldager et al (2008) propose a model of analysis which includes twelve translation micro strategies that are usable in the translation of songs in screen translation, dubbing, subtitling, and literary translation. The classification of Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) model, which was applied in the present study, were indicated as follow;

Table 1.
A Taxonomy of Micro-strategies (Schjoldagar, et al., 2008, as cited in Ghalandar-Zehi & Sadati, 2019*).*

Translation Strategies	Definition
Direct Transfer	Transferring something unchanged
Calque	Transferring the structure or making a very close translation
Direct Translation	Translating in a word for word procedure
Oblique Translation	Translating in a sense for sense procedure
Explicitation	Making implicit information explicit
Paraphrase	Translating rather freely
Condensation	Translating more shortly, which may involve implication (Making explicit information implicit)
Adaptation	Recreating the effect, entirely or partially
Addition	Adding a unit of meaning
Substitution	Changing the meaning
Deletion	Leaving out a unit of meaning
Permutation	Translation in a different place

Schjoldagar et al. (2008) developed the subtitling strategies based on Gottlieb's (1991) subtitling strategies and provided twelve strategies. In this regard, Daragmeh (2014) states that the twelve micro strategies proposed by Schjoldager (2001, 2008) are wildly used in animation songs. Trisnatea (2020) has also used Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) micro strategies to identify the strategies applied by subtitlers in the Japanese-English and the English-Indonesian movies for subtitling animation movies. Trisnatea (2020) found that "Direct translation" and "addition" strategies was the least frequent strategy used by translators in subtitling whilst the "oblique translation" strategy had a large number of usage. In addition, according to El-Masry (2019), translators can use the twelve strategies of Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) model while dubbing audiovisual texts. Therefore, El-Masry (2019) has investigated the strategies applied by the Arabian translators for dubbing the songs in Egyptian animations based on Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) model. El-Masry (2019) asserted that "direct translation is the first commonly used strategy in rendering songs" (p. 439). Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016) have also investigated the most frequently used strategies in the translation of English songs into Persian in dubbed animations based on the micro strategies provided by Schjoldager et al. (2008). Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016) declared that "Adaptation" is the most frequent micro strategy used in translating songs in dubbing. They also asserted that "Calque is the Micro-Strategy which was not used at all in the translation of the songs" (p. 60).

3. Method

3.1. Corpus of the Study

This study aimed to explore the translation strategies used for dubbing and subtitling the animation's songs from English into Persian. Besides, the purpose of this study was to identify the differences that may exist between the strategies used for subtitling and dubbing the songs in some special musical animations. Regarding the specific objectives of the current research,

the corpus of this study consisted of three musical animations which were *"Strange Magic"*, *"Moana",* and*"Frozen 2"*. The focus of the study was on nine selected songs in each animation. The songs had meaningful lyrics, establish the character(s), aid in the narrative, and make the audience relate to the character or the story. Thus, 27 songs were selected as the sample of the study.

The first animation was*"Strange Magic"*. It was an English musical animation. The writers of this animation were Rydstorm, David Berenbaum, and Irene Mecchi (Table 2). The director was Gary Rydstrom. The initial release of *Strange Magic* was on January 29, 2015, and the released place was in Singapore. The entire budget spent on this animation was between70-100$ million. The Strange magic received five awards that they were *BTVA Feature Film Voice Acting Award* (Winner) for best female vocal performance in a feature film in a supporting role, *BTVA Features Film Voice Acting Award* (Nominee) for best vocal ensemble in a feature film, *BTVA Feature Film Voice Acting Award* (Nominee) for best male lead vocal performance in a feature film, *BTVA Feature Film Voice Acting Award* (Nominee) for best female lead vocal performance in a feature film, and *Black Reel Awards* (Nominee) for outstanding vocal performance. Besides, the length of the animation was one hour and 39 minutes. The story of this animation was related to Bog King (Alan Cumming) leader of the dark forest, who hated the notion of love and had ordered the destruction of all primroses, which were an essential ingredient of a love potion.

Table 2.
The Information of the Movie "Strange Magic".

Movie "Strange Magic"	Information
Budget	70-100 million$
Dub company	Tiny Movie Website
Subtitle company	Tiny Movie Website
Initial release	Jan 29, 2015
Released place	Singapore
Writer	Rydstorm, David Berenbaum, and Irene Mecchi
Length of the animation	1 hour 39 minutes
Season's number	1
Number of the songs	13
Production company	Lucasfilm LTD, Lucafilm Animation, Industrial Light, Magic, and Touchstone picture
Award's number	5

This musical animation had 13 songs. Nine songs were selected as the sample including (1) Cannot Help Falling in Love, (2) I'll Never Fall in Love, (3) Three Little Birds, (4) Trouble, (5) Love Is Strange, (6) Say Hey, (7) Straight On, (8) Strange Magic, and (9)Tell Him / Wild Thing. These songs were dubbed and subtitled by Tiny Movie Website in 2015. In this study, the researchers focused on the Tiny Movie Website because this website had fewer mistakes from the other websites which subtitled and dubbed this animation. Therefore, relying on consultation with two experts in the field the Persian dubbed and subtitled version of the

animation on the Tiny Movie Website (2015) was chosen as a more acceptable version for further analysis.

The second animation was*"Moana"*. This animation was also known as *Vaiana* or *Oceania* in some markets. *Moana* was from the creators of *Zootopia* and *Frozen1*. The writers of this animation were Chris Williams, Don Hall, Pamela Ribon, Aaron Kandel, and Jordan Kandell (Table 3). The directors were Ron Clements and John Musker. This animation was produced by Walt Disney Animation Studios and released by Walt Disney Pictures. The animation's initial release was about November 23, 2016. *Moana* was released theatrically in the United States (IMDb.com). This animation received two feature films in the same year. It received two *Academy Awards* nominations at the 89th, one for Best Animated Feature, and another for Best Original Song ('How Far I'll Go') (Geraldo Perez, 2019). The animation's language is in English. The budget of this animation was between 150-175$ million. The length of this animation was one hour and 53 minutes. *Moana* was about the daughter of *Chief Tui*. She starts a voyage to change the situation. Hence, Moana embarks on a journey to return the heart of the goddess named Te Fitti from Maui, a demigod.

Table 3.
The Information of the Movie "Moana".

Movie "Moana"	Information
Language	English
Directors	Ron Clements John Musker
Initial release	Nov 23, 2016 (USA)
Dub Company	Glory Entertainment
Subtitle Company	1 FarsiSubtitle
Budget	150-175$.
Writers	Chris Williams, Don Hall, Pamela Ribon, Aaron Kandel, and Jordan Kandell
Production company	Walt Disney Animation
Released place	USA
Award's number	2
Number of the songs	36
Length of the animation	1hour and 53 minutes
Season's number	1

Moana had 36 songs. Nine songs selected in this animation as a sample includes (1) Shiny, (2) Where Are You, (3) How Far I'll Go, (4) Kakamora, (5) Way Finding, (6) I am Moana, (7) Know Who You Are, and (8) You Are Welcome. The dubbed version of the animation was available on the Glory Entertainment Website and Aparat Website Glory toon Website. Based on consultation with two experts in the field, the dubbed version of the animation on the Glory Entertainment website (2016) was chosen for further investigation since other websites left some dialogues and songs undubbed. The version that the researchers

focused on them was a subtitle by *1Farsi Subtitle*. Because the *1FarsiSubtitle* version had fewer mistakes and did not have any grammatical mistakes.

The third animation was *Frozen 2*. *Frozen 2*'s production company was Walt Disney Animation Studios. The directors were Jennifer Lee and Chris Buck, and the initial release was November 2019 (Table 4). The animation was produced in the United States. Song's writers of this animation were Kristen Anderson Lopez and Robert Lopez, and the composer was Christopher Beck (m.imdb.com, 2019). The second season of *Frozen* was about the answer to this question "Why was Elsa born with magical powers?". *Frozen 2* received generally positive reviews from critics. This animation won two *Annie Awards* for outstanding achievement for animated effects in an animated production and a *Visual Effects Society Award* for outstanding effect simulations in an animated feature (m.imdb.com,2019). At the 92nd *Academy Awards*, the animation received a nomination for Best Original Song for "Into the Unknown" (m.imdb.com,2019). The length of the animation was about one hour and 43 minutes. The budget of this animation was 150 $ million.

Table 4.
The Information of the Movie "Frozen2".

Movie "Frozen2"	Information
Language	English
Initial release	November 2019
Released place	United States
Production company	Walt Disney Animation Studios
Season's number	2
Number of the songs	9
Composer	Christopher Beck
Director	Jennifer Lee and Chris Buck
Dubbed company	King Movie Website
Subtitle company	King Movie Website
Award's number	3
Critic's opinion	received generally positive reviews from critics
Length of the animation	1h 43min

The above-said animation had 9 songs. To achieve the aim of the study all the nine songs were analyzed including (1) All is found; (2) Some things never change; (3) Into the unknown; (4) When I am older; (5) Reindeer; (6) Lost in the wood; (7) Show yourself; (8) The next right thing; and (9) All is found. These songs were dubbed and subtitled by the King Movie Website. The focus was on the King Movie Website's dub and subtitle version because it did not have any grammatical problems and it is fluent besides the other websites that they dub and subtitle this animation. The dubbed version of the animation into the Persian language was available on King Movie Website, Aparat Website, Dootiha Website, and Asriran Website. The King Movie Website in 2019 was the only website that dubbed all the songs and dialogues

of the animation. The other websites did not dub the songs and just dubbed the dialogues.

3.2. Procedures

To achieve the purposes of the study, first, the three animations were carefully watched. In the second step, the songs were identified and extracted from the source text. Third, the subtitled and dubbed versions of the animation songs were precisely read and listened to word by word. Afterward, the source songs were compared with the Persian equivalent of them in subtitled and dubbed versions of animations. Then, the translation strategies, which will be specified in the following step, used for dubbing and subtitling the animation's songs were collected. For the analysis of the corpora, Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) twelve micro strategies were employed. According to Schjoldager et al.'s (2008), translation strategies for subtitling or dubbing the animation's songs have twelve forms: (1) Direct transfer; (2) Calque; (3) Direct translation; (4) Oblique translation; (5) Explicitation; (6) Paraphrase; (7) Condensation; (8) Adaptation; (9) Addition: add a unit of meaning; (10) Substitution; (11) Deletion; and (12) Permutation.

The identified strategies based on Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) model were carefully analyzed to investigate which types of strategies are more frequently and more adequately applied in translating animation's songs in subtitled and dubbed versions. Thus, the frequency and percentage of applied strategies adopted in the Persian dubbed and subtitled versions of the songs were presented to determine the most and the least frequently used strategies by Iranian translators in the Persian language. In the last phase of this study, the different types of translation strategies used in dubbed and subtitled versions of the 27 songs in three animations were compared to identify the differences between the strategies used. The quality of classification of translation strategies used for subtitling and dubbing the songs was reexamined by two experienced translation instructors.

Worth mentioning that, in the present study, the corpus was broken into units of translation. The units of translation were the verse, chorus, and bridge. During the analysis, all lengths of language are used as units of translation because Newmark (1988, pp. 66) makes the crucial point that "All lengths of language can, at different moments and also simultaneously, be used as units of translation in the course of the translation activity". Finally, two expert translation instructors examined the corpus to enhance the reliability of the strategy classifications concerning the adequacy in the translation of texts in literature, the collected data is dissected twice by the researcher to maintain a strategic distance from any missteps in distinguishing translation strategies and their meanings in the entire corpus.

3.3. Data Analysis

To answer the research question, a chi-squared test was used in SPSS, version 26, to identify the significant differences between the strategies used in the subtitled and dubbed versions of the songs.

4. Results and Discussion

This study was intended to investigate the significant difference between Iranian translators' strategies for dubbing and subtitling the songs of animation movies. To do so, a chi-squared

test analysis was performed. As displayed in Table 5, the results indicated a statistically significant difference between six out of 12 strategies used for dubbing and subtitling the animation's songs. The differences were related to Direct Translation (M $_{Dub}$=.19, SD $_{Dub}$=.39, M $_{Sub}$=.47, SD $_{Sub}$=.44, x^2 (1)=427.25 and P-Value=0.000<α=0.05), Oblique translation (M $_{Dub}$=.32, SD $_{Dub}$=.46, M $_{Sub}$=.18, SD $_{Sub}$=.38, x^2 (1)=39.26 and P-Value=0.000<α=0.05), Adaption (M $_{Dub}$=.08, SD $_{Dub}$=.26, M $_{Sub}$=.04, SD $_{Sub}$=.20, x^2 (1)=6.62 and P-Value=0.010<α=0.05), Addition (M $_{Dub}$=.03, SD $_{Dub}$=.15, M $_{Sub}$=.05, SD $_{Sub}$=.21, x^2 (1)=6.23 and P-Value=0.013<α=0.05), Substitution (M $_{Dub}$=.34, SD $_{Dub}$=.47, M $_{Sub}$=.06, SD $_{Sub}$=.23, x^2 (1)=172.43 and P-Value=0.000<α=0.05), and Deletion (M $_{Dub}$=.14, SD $_{Dub}$=.35, M $_{Sub}$=.07, SD $_{Sub}$=.25, x^2 (1)=22.41 and P-Value=0.000<α=0.05).

Table 5.
Chi-squared test of strategies used for dubbing and subtitling the songs of animation movies.

		N	Chi-Square	Asymptotic Significance (2-sided)
Direct transfer	Subtitling	25	0.000	1.000
	Dubbing	25		
Calque	Subtitling	0	---	---
	Dubbing	0		
Direct translation	Subtitling	525	427.251	0.000
	Dubbing	136		
Oblique translation	Subtitling	125	39.262	0.000
	Dubbing	227		
Explicitation	Subtitling	0	2.003	0.157
	Dubbing	2		
Paraphrase	Subtitling	13	0.146	0.703
	Dubbing	15		
Condensation	Subtitling	0	2.003	0.157
	Dubbing	2		
Adaptation	Subtitling	31	6.619	0.010
	Dubbing	54		
Addition	Subtitling	36	6.23	0.013
	Dubbing	18		
Substitution	Subtitling	43	172.43	0.000
	Dubbing	241		
Deletion	Subtitling	48	22.409	0.000
	Dubbing	103		
Permutation	Subtitling	10	1.410	0.235
	Dubbing	16		

As shown in Table 5, Iranian translators use different strategies in dubbing and subtitling the animation's songs. In this regard, four out of 12 strategies such as "Deletion", "Oblique Translation", "Substitution", and "Adaptation", were the most frequently used strategies in dubbing the song of animated movies. However, two out of 12 strategies entitled "Direct Translation" and "Addition" are the most commonly used strategies in subtitling the animation's song. This led to the rejection of the first null hypothesis which is there is no significant difference between Iranian translators' strategies for dubbing and subtitling the songs of animation movies.

In general, the present study aimed to identify the significant difference between Iranian translators' strategies for dubbing and subtitling the songs of selected animation movies from English into Persian. The results of a chi-squared test showed that there is a statistically significant difference between the strategies used by Iranian translators dubbed and subtitled versions of the songs in the animated musical movies. This finding revealed that "Deletion", "Oblique Translation", "Substitution", and "Direct Translation" were the most frequent micro strategies used in dubbing songs in animated musical movies. For instance, "Substitution, implied when there is no direct correspondence" (Malone, 1988, as cited in Simmarano, 2017, p. 19). "This strategy allows the translator to replace one or more terms with another term or replaces one meaning with another" (Trisnatea, 2020, p. 90). Therefore, in this strategy, the original music was kept while the lyrics were changed entirely (Trisnatea, 2020). Thus, the results indicate that Iranian translators not only transfer the dialogue from the source text but also consider the source text idea when dubbing English songs into the Persian language in the selected movies. In addition, it seems that translators in dubbing frequently keep the original music of the animated movies while changing the lyrics entirely. Furthermore, the translators tried to create the same effect and sense from the ST into the TT.

In this regard, the results of this study are in line with the result of El-Masry's (2019) findings. El-Masry (2019) concluded that "Direct translation", "Adaptation", and "Deletion" are the most frequent micro-strategies in rendering the animation songs in dubbing. Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016) also found that "Adaptation" is the most frequent micro strategy used in translating songs in dubbing. This result is presented in the work of Warachananan and Roongrattanakool (2015) who concluded that translating using a related word can be seen in 4.64% of the subtitles of the songs in Walt Disney's animated films into the Thai language. However, the results of the present study contrast with the results of Tekin's (2019) study. Tekin (2019) tried to identify which translation strategies were applied most in the dubbed and subtitled Turkish translation of "Frozen" based on Bell's (1991) equivalent theory. He declared that there are no significant differences among the frequencies of the strategies in the dubbed and subtitled versions of the movie.

Moreover, the results showed that the most commonly used strategies in subtitling songs in animated musical movies were "Direct Translation" and "Addition". It showed that translators in subtitling transfer the dialogue from the source text and do not consider the source text idea. In contrast to the results of this study Trisnatea (2020) found that "Direct translation" and "addition" strategies have a low number of usages in subtitling whilst the "oblique translation" strategy stands as the most frequent strategy applied by translators. Furthermore, the results of the present study contrast with the results of Tekin's (2019) study. Tekin (2019)

tried to identify which translation strategies were applied most in the dubbed and subtitled Turkish translation of "Frozen" based on Bell's (1991) equivalent theory. He declared that there are no significant differences among the frequencies of the strategies in the dubbed and subtitled versions of the movie. In addition, the findings of Aminoroaya and Amirian (2016) asserted that "substitution is the Micro-Strategy which was not used in the translation of the songs" (p. 60). El-Masry (2019) also in their study found that "Substitution" takes the tenth place among Micro-strategies used in song translation" (p. 438). El-Masry (2019) asserted that "substitution and permutation are the least frequent Micro-strategies since Schjoldager et al.'s (2008) theory includes many translation strategies, some of which work as an alternative to substitution and permutation. So, they appear as the least frequent micro-strategies" (p. 439).

5. Conclusion

The present study aimed to determine the differences that may exist between Iranian translators' strategies for dubbing and subtitling the songs of animation movies from English into Persian based on Schioldager et al.'s (2008) twelve micro-strategies. The results revealed that there was a significant difference between the strategies used in the dubbed and subtitled versions of the songs in animated musical movies. It seemed that translators in dubbing do not maintain the structure of the source songs' lyrics by making the close translation to the TT. The results showed that translators in dubbing tried to create the same effect and sense from the ST into the TT. In addition, it reveals that the translator in dubbing not only transfers the dialogue from the source text but also considers the source text idea. In other words, due to the point that word-by-word translation may result in the wrong rendering of the meaning of the songs, translators in dubbing songs translate the idea of source songs with terms that have a similar meaning to the ST, but with the concept that can comprehend properly in the TT. Therefore, they more frequently replace one or more terms with another term or replace one meaning with another when dubbing songs into the Persian language. In this regard, it seems that translators in dubbing frequently keep the original music of the animated movies while changing the lyrics entirely (Trisnatea, 2020).

Thus, the findings reveal that subtitling and dubbing English songs are replete with complexities and challenges. "Translating songs requires someone skilled at poetic aspects of the source and target languages. Someone familiar with musical concepts has a creative mind and is very good at playing with words" (Aminoroaya & Amirian, 2016, p. 63). Hence, to render appropriately the songs, subtitlers and dubbers have to be an expert within the area of translation and improve their translation competencies and linguistic knowledge of the source language and target language. Besides, they are required to have extensive knowledge of SL and TL vocabulary.

The findings of this study offer a pedagogical implication for translation students to recognize subtitling and dubbing strategies utilized in English to Persian translations of songs in musical animated movies. Additionally, the result of this study can be useful for translation instructors in Iranian universities. Thus, instructors teaching translation courses become aware of the frequent strategies applied in the translations of songs and train them in their classes. Moreover, the findings of the present study can use as a guideline for subtitlers, fansubbers, and fan dubbers who translate movies or animations and practice song translation especially.

They can get familiar with strategies utilized in dubbing and subtitling the animation's songs and apply them in their translations.

Declaration of Conflicting Interests
The authors declare that they have no conflicts of interest.

Funding

References

Åkerström, J. (2010). *Translating song lyrics: a study of the translation of the three musicals by Benny Andersson and Björn Ulvaeus*. (Master of Arts Degree in English). Södertörn: Sodertorn University.

Aminoroaya, S., & Amirian, Z. (2016). Investigating the translation of songs in Persian dubbed animated movies. *Journal of Translation and Interpretation*, *10*(2), 44-68.

Bell, R. (1991). *Translation and translating theory and practice*. London: Longman.

Borell, J. (2000). *Subtitling or dubbing? An investigation of the effects of reading subtitles on understanding audiovisual material*. Retrieved from https://www.researchgate.net/publication/27819315_Subtitling_or_dubbing_An_investigation_of_the_effects_from_reading_subtitles_on_understanding_audiovisual_material

Chauhan, B. (2020). *How to use word clouds to build rapport with international audiences*. Retrieved from https://www.participoll.com/using-wordclouds-to-build-rapport-with-international-audiences

Cintas, J. D., & Orero, P. (2010). Voiceover and dubbing. In Y. Gambier & L. van Doorslaer (Eds.), *Handbook of translation studies* (Vol. 1, pp. 441-445). Amsterdam, Philadelphia: John Benjamins.

Cintas, J. D., & Remael, A. (2014). *Audiovisual translation: subtitling*. Routledge.

Chiaro, D. (2013). *Audiovisual translation*. In C. A. Chapelle (Ed.), The encyclopedia of applied linguistics. Oxford, England: Wiley-Blackwell.

Chiaro, D. (2009). Issues in audiovisual translation. *The Routledge companion to translation studies*, *141*, 165.

Daragmeh, A. K. (2014). *Loss and gain in the translation of songs from English into Arabic: the case of dubbed animations* (Doctoral dissertation), An-Najah National University.

El-Masry, M. M. S. E. (2019). Disney in the realm of audiovisual translation: investigating the translation of songs in Egyptian colloquial Arabic dubbed animations. *CDELT Occasional Papers in the Development of English Education*, *68*(1), 421-443.

Franzon, J. (2008). Choices in Song Translation. *The Translator, 14*(2), 373-399. Retrieved from https://docgo.net/philosophy-of-money.html?utm_source=choices-insong-translation-2008

Gottlieb, H. (1991). Subtitling- a new university discipline. In: C. Dollerup, et al. (Ed.). *Teaching translation and interpreting* (pp. 161-70). Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company.

Leni, C., & Pattiwael, A. S. (2019). Analyzing Translation Strategies Utilized in the Translation of Song Do You Want to Build a Snowman?. *Journal of Language and Literature*, *19*(1), 55-64.

Liu, D. (2014). On the Classification of Subtitling. *Journal of Language Teaching & Research*, *5*(5), 1103-1108.

Luyken, G. M., Herbst, T., Langham-Brown, J., Reid, H., & Spinhof, H. (1991). *Overcoming language barriers in television: Dubbing and subtitling for the European audience*. Manchester, UK: European Institute for the Media.

Munday, J. (2016). *Introducing translation studies: Theories and applications*. Routledge.

Newmark, P. (1988). *A textbook of translation*. New York: Prentice-Hall.

Roks, B. (2014). *A study in Subtitles. Translation Universals in Sherlock* (Master's Degree in Linguistics), Leide.

Rurangwa, N. (2005). *Translating Rwandan folktales into English: A culture-based analysis.* Johannesburg: University of the Witwatersrand.

Sadeghpour, H. R. (2013). *Investigating translation strategies used in Persian dubbing of English comedy animations with a focus on humorous, idiomatic, and colloquial expressions* (Unpublished master's thesis). Ferdowsi University of Mashhad, Mashhad, Iran.

Schjoldager, A., Gottlieb, H., & Klitgard I (2008). *Understanding translation*. Denmark: Gyldendal Akademisk Group.

Shuttleworth, M., & Cowie, M. (2004). *Dictionary of Routledge encyclopedia of translation studies.*Manchester: St Jerome

Simmarano, C. (2017). *Tesi di Laurea–translation in music: from the Italian pop song to the international hit.* Retrieved from https://d1wqtxts1xzle7.cloudfront.net/56226533/Tesi_di_laurea_Carmela_Simmarano-with-cover-page-v2.pdf?Expires=1630022847&Signature=WP

Stephenson, J. (2014). *Quizás, quizás, quizás: Translators' dilemmas and solutions when translating Spanish songs into English* (Doctoral dissertation), Spain: University of Granada.

Stolze, R. (2003). Translating for children - World view or pedagogics? *Meta, 48*(1-2), 208-221.

Susam-Sarajeva, Ş. (2008). Translation and music: changing perspectives, frameworks, and significance. *Translation and Music 14* (2), 187-200.

Trisnatea, M. M. K. (2020). *Translation shifts in the Japanese-English and the English-Indonesian subtitles in Howl's moving castle movie* (Doctoral dissertation), Universitas Sanata Dharma Yogyakarta.

Warachananan, P., & Roongrattanakool, D. (2015). *A study of translation strategies in the translation of songs in Walt Disney's animated feature films into Thai versions*. In National and international conference interdisciplinary research for local development sustainability, 75–84.